

Mission: The Ludington Area School District, in partnership with parents and community, will educate and empower students to adapt and succeed in their future.

Electronic / Virtual Meeting: Finance Committee

Date: April 16, 2020

Time: 5:30 p.m.

Place: Ludington Area School District Administration Office
809 East Tinkham Avenue, Ludington, Michigan

- 1) CALL TO ORDER & ROLL CALL
 - ☐ Josh Snyder ☐ Steve Carlson ☐ Scott Foster
- 2) CITIZEN PARTICIPATION
- 3) AGENDA MODIFICATION
- 4) DISCUSSION ITEMS
 - a) Letters of Agreement:
 - i. Ludington Education Association (LEA)
 - ii. Ludington Educational Support Personnel Association (LESPA)
 - b) Technology Bid Awards
 - c) Underground Plumbing Bid Award - Bid Package #2
 - d) Material Testing Bid Award
 - e) Bond Pay Application #1
 - f) Updates from Other Committees
- 5) OTHER ITEMS OF BUSINESS & ANNOUNCEMENTS
- 6) ADJOURNMENT

This is a meeting of the Board of Education in public for the purpose of conducting the School District's business and is not to be considered a public community meeting. Official minutes of the Ludington Board of Education are available for public inspection during normal business hours at the Board of Education's Central Business Office, 809 E. Tinkham Avenue, Ludington, Michigan, 231-845-7303. The Ludington Area School District is an equal opportunity employer and provider. If you are an individual with a disability who is in need of special accommodations to attend or participate in a public meeting please contact Superintendent Jason J. Kennedy at 231-845-7303 at least 24 hours prior to the meeting or as soon as possible.

Memorandum - Office of the Superintendent

TO: Board of Education
FROM: Jason Kennedy, Superintendent
RE: Finance Committee Meeting ~ Agenda Notes

Meeting Notice and Meeting Access Information:

This notice is given and published pursuant to the Executive Order issued by Gretchen Whitmer, Governor of the State of Michigan.

The Finance/Negotiations Committee of the Board of Education for Ludington Area School District will meet on Thursday, April 16, 2020 at 5:30 pm for its monthly committee meeting as a virtual meeting (online and/or by phone) to protect the health, safety, and welfare of the citizens of Ludington Area School District from Coronavirus/COVID-19, pursuant to law and Executive Order issued by Governor Gretchen Whitmer.

Public comment will be handled using the “Raise Hand” feature (as instructed below) within the participant controls of the Zoom platform. If you are listening by telephone only, you will be called upon by the host.

To comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), any citizen requesting accommodation to attend this meeting and/or to obtain this notice in an alternative format, should contact Superintendent Jason Kennedy, Ludington Area School District at (231) 845-7303 at least two days prior to this meeting.

Zoom Instructions for Participants

To join the conference by phone:

1. On your phone, dial the teleconferencing number provided below.
2. Enter the **Meeting ID number** (also provided below) when prompted using your touch-tone (DTMF) keypad.

Before a videoconference:

1. You will need a computer, tablet, or smartphone with speakers or headphones. You will have the opportunity to check your audio immediately upon joining a meeting.
2. Details, phone numbers, and links to the video conference or conference call are provided below. The details include a link to “Join via computer” as well as phone numbers for a conference call option. It will also include the 9-digit Meeting ID.

To join the videoconference:

1. At the start time of your meeting, enter the link to join via computer. You may be instructed to download the Zoom application.

2. You will have an opportunity to test your audio at this point by clicking on “Test computer audio.” Once you are satisfied that your audio works, click on “Join audio by computer.”
3. You may also join a meeting without the link by going to join.zoom.us on any browser and entering the Meeting ID provided below.
4. If you are having trouble hearing the meeting, you can join via telephone while remaining on the video conference:
 1. On your phone, dial the teleconferencing number provided below.
 2. Enter the Meeting ID number (provided below) when prompted using your touch-tone (DTMF) keypad.
 3. If you have already joined the meeting via computer, you will have the option to enter your 2- digit participant ID to be associated with your computer.

Participant controls in the upper right corner of the Zoom screen:

Using the icons in the upper right corner of the Zoom screen, you can:

- Mute/Unmute your microphone (far left)
- Turn on/off camera (“Start/Stop Video”)
- Invite other participants
- View participant list: Opens a pop-out screen that includes a “Raise Hand” icon that you may use to raise a virtual hand during Public Comment (Dial *9 if using a touch tone phone only)
- Change your screen name that is seen in the participant list and video window
- You may toggle between “speaker” and “gallery” view. “Speaker view” shows the active speaker. “Gallery view” tiles all of the meeting participants.

Meeting Information:

Topic: Finance Committee Meeting

Time: Apr 16, 2020 05:30 PM Eastern Time (US and Canada)

Click here to join the Zoom Meeting:

<https://zoom.us/j/93806005525?pwd=SkhiTW5uTGhyclZLdzIzZHNFdC9LUT09>

Meeting ID: 938 0600 5525

Password: 2iv9fQ

Dial by your location below to join the Zoom meeting:

+1 312 626 6799 US (Chicago)

+1 646 558 8656 US (New York)

+1 253 215 8782 US

+1 301 715 8592 US

+1 346 248 7799 US (Houston) +1 669 900 9128 US (San Jose)

Find your local number: <https://zoom.us/u/a48ChMjPj>

Letters of Agreement: LEA and LESPA

We will discuss Letters of Agreement that are necessary to comply with the Executive Orders (EO) of Governor Gretchen Whitmer and to receive continued State Aid payments, specifically pertaining to the requirement to pay school employees while implementing a Continuity of Learning Plan. EO 2020-35 establishes conditions for schools to receive K-12 state aid for the 2019-20 school year. To receive continued state aid payments, schools must adopt and implement an approved Plan. EO 2020-35 requires that each school's Plan "continue to pay school employees, subject to any applicable requirements of a collective bargaining agreement."

Technology Bid Awards

The District has reviewed bids submitted by four (4) different vendors for technology needs, including UPS equipment, network switches, and other wireless components that support our wifi network. These purchases were already built into the elementary school construction project budget, but because we have access to a federal grant called E-Rate, we can purchase this technology at 20% of cost, and have the other 80% funded from the grant. This provides a savings of \$331,600 on the total project cost of \$414,500.63 and will allow us to use these already budgeted bond funds to address other needs in the scope of the project.

Vector Tech is a company that we work with regularly, and Ruckus Network and Wireless Equipment is only offered by Vector Tech of those that submitted bids. According to Communications by Design, there are many reasons why selecting a single Contractor might be desirable from an Owner perspective.

- By selecting a single Contractor, you are also selecting a single brand of equipment (network and wireless). Generally speaking, in IT, it is desirable to have the management of devices under "a single pane of glass." This means that when monitoring and troubleshooting equipment, using fewer management tools is more efficient and easier. So, if the district decided to accept the Vector Tech Group network proposal and the Moss wireless proposal they would be managed using separate interfaces/tools.
- Selecting a single Contractor to complete the project work requires less coordination. This is not a major issue, but the coordination of the installation of the wireless access points and the installation of network equipment does take some time.
- Less finger pointing in the event of a technical problem, purchasing all of the equipment from one Contractor/Manufacturer removes all excuses regarding interoperability.

A bid summary is outlined in the table below:

Bidder Name	Section 26 33 53 UPS Units	Section 27 21 19 Network Electronics	Section 27 21 33 Wireless Networks	Bid Total	Notes:
Sentinel	\$28,935.00				

Trace3	\$31,610.43	\$471,908.25	\$150,262.20	\$653,780.88	Meraki
VectorTech	\$27,857.69	\$213,639.23	\$138,927.11	\$380,424.03	Ruckus
Moss	\$34,335.05	\$288,393.21	\$121,285.79	\$444,014.05	Aruba/HP

The difference in the project total being recommended for approval from the original base bid amount is the acceptance of several alternates by the District. The District has attached a worksheet below that was used to calculate the project total. As you can see, the main difference is the addition of 5 year warranties in the three bid categories. In addition to that, there is also the acceptance of an alternate for a second power supply in 50% of the provided network equipment. This is to support all of the new network attached devices that will be installed in the new elementary school and renovated HS/MS (speakers, clocks, door access, wireless access points etc.), which will all require power from the network switches.

Vector Tech Group Alternate Breakdown		
Original Base Bid Amount Wireless	\$138,927.11	\$138,927.11
5 Year Warranty Alternate	\$17,417.40	\$17,417.40
Onsite Controller Vs. Virtual	-\$7,196.35	
Wireless Equipment Total		\$156,344.51
Original Base Bid Amount Network	\$213,639.23	\$213,639.23
5 Year Warranty Alternate	\$1,495.10	\$1,495.10
Alternate Optics	-\$8,821.37	
All Edge switches with 2nd power supply	\$24,664.50	
1/2 edge switches with 2nd power supply	\$12,332.25	\$12,332.25
Redundant Building Links	\$6,000.00	
Support Edge Switches 3 year	\$21,869.19	
Support Edge Switches 5 year	\$36,448.65	
Network Equipment Total		\$227,466.58
Original Base Bid Amount UPS	\$27,857.69	\$27,857.69
5 Year Warranty Alternate	\$2,831.85	\$2,831.85
UPS Equipment Total		\$30,689.54
Project Total		\$414,500.63

I will recommend that the following action item be approved at Monday's Board meeting:

To approve a contract with Vectortech of Holland, Michigan in the amount of \$414,500.63 for UPS equipment including 5-year warranty alternate, Network Electronics including 5-year warranty alternate and 50% additional edge switch power supplies and Wireless equipment including 5 year warranty alternate to be paid with funds from the 2019 bond proceeds. Contingent upon approval of year 2020 eRate funding.

Underground Plumbing Bid Award - Bid Package #2

The District held a public virtual bid opening at 3:00 pm on Tuesday, April 14, 2020 in collaboration with the Christman Company. As you are aware, all labor and materials for school

construction (over the statutory threshold of approximately \$25,000) must be competitively bid in accordance with MCL 380.1267 – which requires compliance with various statutory mandates, including that bids must be opened and read aloud at a public meeting advertised in the published bid notice. Note that a “public meeting” is not the same as an “open meeting” under the Open Meetings Act. Two executive orders are most applicable:

- Executive Order 2020-21 says, in part: “All in-person government activities at whatever level (state, county, or local) that are not necessary to sustain or protect life, or to supporting those businesses and operations that are necessary to sustain or protect life, are suspended.” Executive Order 2020-21 prohibits most in-person government activities.
- Executive Order 2020-15 allows the use of technology to facilitate public participation remotely to the same extent as if the public appeared in person. Since the public is permitted the right to see and hear bids being opened and read aloud, the District facilitated the virtual public meeting accordingly.

The Christman Company opened all bids submitted by contractors electronically. The District, any contractors, and those from the public were able to view all of the bids through the screen sharing functionality of the video conferencing application, *Blue Jeans*. Following the opening of the bids, representatives from the Christman Company, GMB Architecture + Engineering, and the District will conduct a post bid interview with the low bidder. The Christman Company will then complete a review of the company’s financial records, complete the appropriate background and work history checks, review each company’s EMR rating by their insurance company, and review the safety records for each company. The Christman Company will then use this information to make a bid award recommendation to the District. We will be recommending the award of this bid at the board meeting on Monday, April 20, 2020.

A summary of the bids received is outlined below:

		Ludington Area Schools New Elementary Bid Opening - BP 2 Underground Plumbing Opened at 3pm on April 14, 2020	
WC	Bidder	Base Bid	WC Budget
27A	Underground Plumbing		\$ 274,766
	Andy Egan DBA Pressures and Pipes	\$ 302,400	
	Rite-Way Plumbing and Heating	\$ 327,575	

Material Testing Bid Award

A summary of the material testing bids received is outlined below:

	Driesenga & Assoc.		Soils and Structures		West Michigan Testing (Nordlund)	
	Total Hours/ Unit Price	Total Cost	Total Hours/ Unit Price	Total Cost	Total Hours/ Unit Price	Total Cost
Soil Compaction - Foundations	245	\$12,250	40	\$2,800	52	\$3,705
Soil Compaction - Backfill & Floors		\$1,750	30	\$2,100		
Soil Compaction - Site Development			30	\$2,100		
Asphalt Density	40	\$2,200	30	\$2,100	40	\$3,075
Asphalt Extraction			Unit Price: 6	\$2,460	Unit Price: 8	\$1,070
Concrete Ftg./Foundations			60	\$4,200	100	\$6,000
Found. Observation/Rebar Inspect.						
Concrete Floors	600	\$30,000	60	\$4,200		
Concrete Exterior			20	\$1,400		
Masonry Inspections			26	\$2,340	20	\$2,900
Concrete - Test Cyl	330	\$3,300	Unit Price: 600	\$9,600	Unit Price: 100	\$1,500
Steel Reinforcing					32	\$1,920
Structural Inspections	80	\$5,840	50	\$4,500	8	\$800
Gran. Proctor		230	Unit Price: 2	400	3	450
MI Cone		500	Unit Price: 6	450		
Floor Moisture			20	\$1,400		
RH Tests		\$3,740	30	\$2,250	30	\$1,800
Field/Lab Supervisor			20	\$1,700		
Fireproofing (N/A)					Not Needed: 8	\$800
Admin Services	154	\$5,390	20	\$1,000		
Additional Trip Charges						
Trip Costs	Unit Price: 154	\$15,400				
PM	164	\$14,760				
	Total Hours Only:	Total	Total Hours Only:	Total	Total Hours Only:	Total
	1283	\$95,360	436	\$45,000	282	\$24,020

Budget:

- Material Testing Budget: \$50,000
- Recommended Firm Proposal: \$45,000

The Christman Company has received proposals for Construction Material Testing. These recommendations, summarized below, represent the firm that we believe provided the qualified, responsive bid for material testing, after reviewing all proposals and verifying qualifications. The construction manager is seeking concurrence from Ludington Area Schools on The Christman Company's recommendations for contract awards for these Work Categories prior to making an award.

Proposals received: SME, Driesenga & Associates, Soils & Structures, Nordlund & Associates

- **Recommended Testing Contractor: Soils and Structures (\$45,000)**
- Do not recommend: Nordlund (West MI Testing) (\$24,020)
- Do not recommend Driesenga & Assoc. (\$95,360)
- Do not recommend SME (\$100,00-130,000)
 - A full proposal was not received but a budget cost was sent.

Bond Pay Application #1

We will review the first pay application and certificate for payment of bond work completed by Terra Contracting and the Christman Company.

Updates from Other Committees

We will review updates from each of the other committees in preparation for the Board meeting on April 20, 2020.